

## **Estudio de caso de la fase II en Haití de la educación para todos del banco mundial**

### **The world bank's education for all phase II in Haiti case study**

Andrés Chávez

*Universidad Internacional del Ecuador, Ecuador*

Nyoka Joseph

*Columbia University, Estados Unidos*

Leonardo Franco

*Columbia University, Estados Unidos*

Phineas Leng

*Columbia University, Estados Unidos*

Garvey Pierre

*Columbia University, Estados Unidos*

Autor para correspondencia: [gnp2105@tc.columbia.edu](mailto:gnp2105@tc.columbia.edu), [pwl2106@tc.columbia.edu](mailto:pwl2106@tc.columbia.edu),  
[lef2135@tc.columbia.edu](mailto:lef2135@tc.columbia.edu), [nj2166@tc.columbia.edu](mailto:nj2166@tc.columbia.edu), [anchavezer@internacional.edu.ec](mailto:anchavezer@internacional.edu.ec)

Fecha de recepción: 10 de enero de 2016 - Fecha de aceptación: 17 de febrero de 2016

#### **Resumen**

Este estudio se enfoca en las metas establecidas en el programa Education For All Phase II y en el trabajo que el Banco Mundial ha realizado para poder alcanzar las metas para Haití. Esta investigación analizará Calidad en la Educación, El fortalecimiento Institucional y de Gobierno, y las Nuevas Tendencias en Educación Internacional y Desarrollo.

**Palabras claves:** banco mundial; education for all; haití, reformas educativas

#### **Abstract**

This study focuses on the established goals of Phase II of Education For All and the work that World Bank has done in order to reach these goals in Haiti. This research will analyze Quality of Education, Institutional Strengthening and Governance, and New Trends in International Development Education.

**Key words:** world bank; education for all; haiti; education reforms

## **Introduction**

As the largest donor in international educational development, with three billion dollars of annual loans, the World Bank leads the international educational development field (Heyneman, 2003). Being the largest donor allows the development bank to drive the development discourse, making it an ideal choice to analyze for a case study. The decision of the group to narrow the focus on Haiti is driven by a number of factors. It is the poorest country in the Western hemisphere and it has experienced one of the largest natural disasters in recent years. Added to this is the fact that 60 percent of the population lives in rural areas and between 80-85 percent of primary schools are private. This has attracted donors and NGOs to converge on the country making it a fascinating context to study. This case study presents an analysis of the World Bank's involvement in Haiti as part of the Education for All (EFA) Phase II initiative. First, the paper will offer a brief historical context of educational development in Haiti followed by an analysis of the biggest challenges it currently faces. Consequently, the study will discuss and outline the key policies of EFA Phase II relating to access to education, increasing the quality of education, building institutional capacity in the education sector, and monitoring and evaluation. By using information obtained from extensive interviews with World Bank employees and other NGOs working in Haiti this section of the paper will analyze the progress and current situation in relation to stated objectives. Following this, the paper will examine the current and future trends shaping international educational development and the pedagogical discourse in Haiti. The paper will conclude with some general observations found by engaging in this case study.

## **Relevant history and context**

The Republic of Haiti, located in the Caribbean, occupies the western one third of the island of Hispaniola that it shares with the Dominican Republic. After gaining independence in 1804 from France, following a slave revolt, Haiti established itself as the first black republic in the Western hemisphere. However, a long history of diplomatic and economic isolation, political instability and social unrest has not only limited economic opportunity and growth but has resulted in a loss of human capital (Carlson et al. 2011). For instance, the 2013 Human Development report ranks Haiti 161 out of an eligible 186 countries with an index of 0.456, signifying real deficits in income, health and education. Carlson et al. (2011) argues that "the most pressing priority in stimulating the development of Haiti is in the improvement of its education system" (p. 5).

## **Previous Education Reforms**

Two major reforms in the latter half of the twentieth century have attempted to orient educational development in Haiti towards a modernized framework: The Bernard Reform of 1978 and the National Plan of Education and Training (NPET) in 1997. These reforms collectively attempted to align the school structure with labor market demands, affirm the right to education for all, introduce the Creole language as an official language of instruction along with French, and make quality and student centered pedagogy a focus (Hadjadj, 2000). Although creole was made an official language, when interviewing Moise Derosier, the Education Program Director at Color of Hope, a non-profit grassroots community organization, he stated that there

had been no real change in the pedagogy of the education system. He alluded to the fact that the language of instruction continues to be predominantly French, which most children do not speak, upon entering formal schooling and that asking them to think critically in a language they do not speak is problematic (M. Derosier, personal communication, December, 7th 2013). More recently, the 2008 Presidential Commission for Education in Haiti reform has three objectives “100 percent enrollment of all school-age children, a free education to all, including textbooks and materials, and a hot meal daily for each child” (Carlson et. al, 2011, p.16). Standardizing the national curriculum is also a major focus of this reform.

### **Education Sector**

The challenges to the development of the education sector in Haiti is a combination of continuous and historical struggles with political instability, social unrest, income inequality, stagnant economic growth, migration of skilled and educated citizens, and most recently natural disasters. However, political instability has impeded development at every level of Haitian society. A legacy of authoritarian regimes, coup d'états, and foreign occupancies has made it difficult for education reforms to gain traction, continuity and sustainability (Hadjadj, 2000; Diaz et al., 2008). Many people interviewed for this case study reiterated the challenges associated with political instability. A World Bank Official, Senior Operations Officer at the World Bank is quoted as saying that “the most challenging thing is to ensure continuity, what political instability brings is no continuity in terms of vision because the different minister can have different priority and that is really really difficult because sometimes priority is not linked to some analysis, it’s just because of some political interest” (World Bank Official, personal communication, December 3rd, 2013).

The issue of quality basic education in Haiti has always been a challenge, but until recently access was seen as the major obstacle. While school access has increased, due to the availability of private schools, the quality of the education system has suffered because of the lack of accreditation by some of these institutions (Wolff, 2008). Historically, access to public education has been hampered by the state’s lack of investment and as a result the sector has become increasingly privatized. A 2002-03 World Bank education census revealed that only eight percent of Haitian schools were public, which left 92 percent of the market to be privately owned and financed (Luzincourt & Gulbrandson, 2010). Ten years later, the experts interviewed approximated that between 80-85 percent of the market was privatized, which implies movement in a positive direction. It was estimated that before the 2010 earthquake public schools only had the capacity to serve a quarter of the school age population, which meant that access to public schools was competitive. Also, many school districts in rural areas did not have public schools therefore limiting access to children whose families could only afford to pay for private school (Carlson et al, 2011).

Many private schools are incapable of providing quality education, principally because there is little incentive to do so. The overall absence of accountability, monitoring, evaluation, and reporting standards set by the Haitian Ministry of National Education and Professional Training (MENFP) was echoed. Luzincourt & Gulbrandson (2010) reported that 70 percent of schools in Haiti lacked accreditation. The poor quality is also attributable to a lack of resources (inadequate infrastructure, textbooks, desks, chairs, and teaching materials), poor management

and organizational structures, and a lack of teacher training and qualified teachers (Hadjadj, 2000). The impact of poor quality education is reflected in indicators such as literacy rates, dropout rates, repetition rates, completion rates, and the percentage of over-aged students (Wolff, 2008).

### **The World Bank's Involvement in Haiti**

Since 2004, the World Bank has assumed more of a leadership role through its support for the Haitian Government in developing a national strategy for Education for All. Through providing technical and financial assistance and helping to coordinate with other development partners it aimed to "improve transparency and strengthen civil society" (World Bank, 2013, p.1). The Bank's support for educational governance reform led to the US\$6.4 million LICUS trust fund grant program, established in 2004 which "focused on improving public-private partnerships in the education sector" (World Bank, 2010, p.3).

The implementation of the EFA Adaptable Program Grant Phase I in 2007, focused on the implementation of the National EFA strategy concentrated on improving access and equity to primary school. Through support of the EFA-Fast Track Initiative, the Economic Governance Reform Operation (EGRO II) and the Heavily Indebted Poor Countries (HIPC) initiative that provided debt relief, these other reforms also included education policy (World Bank, 2006, p.4). Currently the Haiti EFA Phase II initiative in 2011 is active and aims to improve access, quality, institutional capacity of the education sector, and monitoring and evaluation. Challenges as a result of the 2010 earthquake have also led the Bank to follow up with projects focused on disaster management (World Bank, 2013).

### **Challenges**

#### **Earthquake**

On January 12, 2010, a 7.3 magnitude earthquake struck Haiti and caused significant damages to the country. The earthquake's epicenter was located around 17km west of Haiti's heavily populated capital, Port-au-Prince, leaving 1.3 million people displaced and 700,000 school children without access to school (Rivera, 2011). The Inter-American Development Bank estimated that 200,000 people were killed and US\$ 8-16 billion were lost in damages (Fund for Peace, 2012). Haiti's Education Cluster Performance Satisfaction Survey Report showed that, in 2012, there were still more than 300,000 people who remained in makeshift tents in camps, while 50 percent of debris had been removed, 56 percent of schools' infrastructure remained damaged or destroyed (Haiti Education Cluster, 2012).

#### **Cholera Outbreak**

In October 2010, 9 months after the earthquake, Haiti faced another disaster in the form of a cholera outbreak. The Center for Disease Control (CDC) reported that the Haitian Ministry of Public Health and Population (MSPP) and the Haitian National Public Health Laboratory identified the strain of *Vibrio cholera* on October 21, 2010 (CDC, 2011). This would be Haiti's first cholera outbreak in a century. As of October 17, 2013, the CDC reported 684,085 cases and 8,361 deaths, which have taken a significant toll on the Haitian population (CDC, 2013). It is

important to note that the cholera outbreak was attributed to Nepalese peacekeepers since the strain was not endemic to the island prior to their arrival. The United Nations has not accepted responsibility for the outbreak despite criticism from independent researchers and human rights activists.

### **Internally Displaced Persons (IDPs)**

Three years after the earthquake, an estimated 350,000 people remain internally displaced living in temporary housing placements around the Port-au-Prince area. It is difficult to deliver education services to those individuals who have not found a permanent home. Elizabeth Ferris and Rebecca Winthrop's essay (2010) on the conditions of refugees and internally displaced people highlights many of the challenges found in Haiti's context. Ferris and Winthrop state "in almost all post-conflict situations, the transition between humanitarian relief and development actors is a rocky one. While humanitarian actors may judge that the emergency is over, conditions are often too uncertain or insecure for development actors to launch large-scale programs, including programs to restore formal education" (Ferris & Winthrop, 2010, Page 48). The Haitian government, along with the World Bank and other partners, now understand the need to work together beyond an emergency context in order for them to address the structural challenges found in Haiti's education system.

### **Institutional Challenges**

With an annual GDP of US\$673 per person, the Haitian population operates within immense economic constraints and faces conditions of extreme poverty. After the earthquake, the Haitian economy contracted by 5.4 percent in 2010 but was able to grow by 6.1 percent in 2011 due to reconstruction efforts. This surge in GDP growth was mainly due to a large influx from donors who pledged a grand total of US\$5.6 billion for 2010-2011. The authorities anticipated an annual growth rate of seven percent for the next few years but the country's GDP turned out to be 2.8 percent in 2012. The country remains heavily dependent on international aid, because of its unbalanced budget of \$1.812 billion in revenues and \$2.279 billion in expenditures in 2012 (CIA, 2013). With these limited resources, the government ability to function properly is severely limited. Rachel Hermes from Catholic Relief Services highlighted the fact that there were three different ministers of education during her two years in Haiti (R. Hermes, personal communication, December 5, 2013). With this high turnover of staff, Rachel discussed some of the difficulties that she faced in helping the ministry with capacity building. Moise Derosier, the Education Program Director at Color of Hope, also pointed to this turnover issue as an obstacle to continuity and as a barrier for sound policy (M. Derosier, personal communication, December 6-7, 2013).

Based on the UNDP's (2012) International Human Development Indicators, Haiti's public expenditure on education is at 1.5 percent. The lack of investment in education can be partly attributed to that fact that Haiti's relatively small budget is not sufficient enough to make significant investments in many of its public sectors in need. Over 50 percent of the Haitian population lives on US\$1/day and 78 percent live on less than US\$2/day (World Bank, 2011). With the average tuition cost at US\$70 per child/per year, it is estimated that 400,000-500,000 children aged 6-12 were not able to attend school (World Bank, 2011). With the 80 percent of

schools being private and a limited government capacity to provide educational services, many parents struggle to enroll their children in schools. Jeff Ramin from the Global Partnership for Education (GPE) attested to the fact that “there are quite a number of out of school children” (J. Ramin, personal communication, December 8, 2013). Jeff also pointed to the fact that many of the private schools are not offering the type of education quality that would serve the needs of their students (J. Ramin, personal communication, December 8, 2013). He pointed to the government’s inability to set national standards that can be easily enforced while also mentioning the difficulties that the World Bank is facing in working on policy issues with the Haitian government (J. Ramin, personal communication, December 8, 2013).

Coordination is one of the biggest challenges between the multitudes of actors on the ground. Rachel Hermes from Catholic Relief Services explained how hard it is to know what each organization is responsible for as she lamented the fact that “there are a lot of good intentions and it does not always translate into coordinating efforts.” (R. Hermes, personal communication, December 5, 2013). Axelle Latortue from the World Bank expressed similar concerns as she highlighted an “active donor group” that holds bi-weekly meetings that are meant to ensure that there are no overlaps in what people are doing (A. Latortue, personal communication, November 25, 2013). Melissa Adelman also pointed to the multitude of actors and a lack coordination as some of the main challenges that she faced while working in Haiti. Paul Frisoli, an Education Technical Advisor, lamented the fact that the MENFP fails to drive the actors on the ground in a way that would coherently direct the country’s policy (P. Frisoli, personal communication, December 2, 2013).

In light of these institutional challenges, the Haitian government is starting to make stride in funding their national budgets. A World Bank official said that the Haitian government has started taxing international money transfers and international telephone calls as a measure to raise revenues through which it hopes to increase its public expenditures (World Bank official, personal communication, December 3, 2013). Furthermore, Jeff mentioned that GPE is working on an actionable education sector plan with clearly defined priorities and budget to ensure continuity regardless of the minister of education. While these are steps in the right direction, the lack of institutional strength and stability remains a barrier preventing Haiti from improving its educational system.

### **The World Bank’s Involvement in Education in Haiti**

The World Bank’s involvement in Haiti has been both extensive and diverse ranging from projects in agriculture, highway/transport, and energy all aimed at improving economic development. The Bank’s focus on educational development began with the Basic Education Project, which was eventually dropped, and then re-launched, with the Education Project in 1976 through 1991. Project IV of the V part Education Project in 1985 was the Bank’s first real attempt at improving the quality of education and growth in educational coverage (Hadjadj, 2000).

The implementation of the EFA Adaptable Program Grant Phase I in 2007, focused on improving access to primary school. Currently the Haiti EFA Phase II initiative in 2011 is active and aims to improve access, quality, institutional capacity of the education sector, and

monitoring and evaluation. Challenges as a result of the 2010 earthquake have also led the Bank to follow up with projects focused on disaster management (World Bank, 2013).

## **Key policies for education for all phase II**

### **Access to Education**

Enrollment rates in public and secondary schools in Haiti are among the lowest in the world. Seventy-six percent of children attend primary school, while only 22 percent attend secondary school (World Bank, 2012). Eighty percent of children who are enrolled in school attend private schools (World Bank, 2013). These non-public schools constitute 85 percent of the schools in Haiti; yet only 25 percent of them are registered in the Ministry of Education's official database (M. Derosier, personal communication, December 6-7, 2013). The fees associated with private schooling make it difficult for many families to enroll children in school. While the Haitian government spends an average of only 1.1 to 2 percent of its GDP on education, the remaining 7 percent is up to parents to pay if they are to send their children to school (RAND, 2010). This is especially a problem because the average Haitian family has 4.5 children (M. Derosier, personal communication, December 6-7, 2013). Schools fees quickly become overwhelming for families at that rate. A major obstacle to education in Haiti is the highly dense yet extensively dispersed rural population. In 2004, it was calculated that approximately 60 percent of the population lived in rural areas, and these people live in "thousands of networks of very small villages, each within a walking distance of 20 minutes to one hour" (World Bank, 2011a, p. 71). Most of these villages are isolated due to a limited road infrastructure, and several rivers break up paths to access villages; this acts as a barrier for school-aged children in rural areas to access education services.

There are, however, many community schools in Haiti; field visits have confirmed that even in the most remote areas of the country, at least one out of every four villages has some type of community school. For a while, these schools were receiving assistance from NGOs and faith-based organizations, which led to high enrollment rates. However, when this aid was withdrawn, parents of students were unable to pay for teachers' salaries, and the majority of the teachers were forced to move on. This left the schools in poor shape, though many of them were able to remain open due to a small number of teachers who chose to stay and provide some type of education. However, due to the decrease in teachers and the poor quality of education that they were able to provide, enrollment declined sharply, and very few students continued to attend these schools (World Bank, 2011a).

When Haiti returned to a democratic government in 2007, the World Bank funded the Education For All Adaptable Program Grant in order to help with the transition. This program was in effect until 2010; in 2011, the government of Haiti and the World Bank began the second phase of EFA. By the end of the 2011-2012 school year approximately 170,000 children from poor families were able to enroll in private schools because of the subsidies provided by this program. The program works by giving schools US\$90 per child, and requiring schools to commit to "have a minimum number of qualified teachers and provide each beneficiary child with three textbooks and a uniform" (World Bank, 2012, p.1). These subsidies cover most of the expenses of the first six years of a child's primary education; however, many poor families are

still unable to send their children to school because they cannot afford educational expenses that are not covered by the subsidy, such as additional textbooks and school supplies (World Bank, 2012). Additionally, it has been a common problem for schools to receive their payments late; in some cases, schools have charged parents in order to remain in operation and then returned the money to them when the subsidies arrived (Axelle). This clearly presents a problem for those parents who are unable to provide funds for schools, even in a short-term situation.

EFA Phase II focuses mainly on quality in education, but it also addresses three main components of access to education in order to continue to increase primary enrollment. These components are eliminating school fees, increasing the supply of classrooms and teachers in rural areas, and contributing to health and nutrition in the schools. The plan for attending to these areas consists of increasing funding for the Tuition Waiver Program, improving basic educational services in selected rural communities, and strengthening the Health and Nutrition Program in the recipient schools (World Bank, 2011a, p.6).

The Tuition Waiver Program will receive an increase of US\$31 million in order to pay tuition for students in non-public schools and provide them with textbooks (World Bank, 2011a, p. 7). This additional funding will help many more children to enroll in school across the country. According to World Bank official, there are currently 1.5 million children in Haiti receiving the tuition waiver. To support rural communities, US \$7 million will go towards building and rehabilitating schools in rural communities that have a lack of proper schools, a minimum school age population of 25 children, and a minimum level of community organization and school capital (World Bank, 2011a, p. 7). This will help to restore many of the failing community schools in rural Haiti, as well as provide more accessible schools for children who live in remote villages that cannot travel to school. An additional US\$7 million will go towards the support of the “consultancies with service-providers, and operating costs of the National School Feeding Program. Service providers would deliver a morning snack and a hot meal daily to participating schools” (World Bank, 2011a, p. 7). These meals are important because they often represent the only full meal that children in Haiti eat during the day, and this provides an extra incentive for parents to send their children to school. It additionally works to help their performance in the classroom.

The World Bank focuses on private education in situations such as Haiti because “the public-sector provision of education is highly inefficient and poor in quality. These deficiencies reduce demand for education” (Alexander, 2001, p. 309). Additionally, public education is often just as biased against families in poverty as private education, so providing access to education for children from these circumstances often requires subsidies. According to World Bank official, many government officials in Haiti own private schools, so there is little motivation for them to fix the public education system. This represents a conflict of interest and has been an obstacle to progress in the project. However, it is the duty of the government to provide free, compulsory education for all primary age children to the best of their ability. Providing subsidies for poor children to enroll in private schools does not constitute a truly free education because it is dependent on external support. Therefore, the government of Haiti should focus more on improving the public education sector so that enrollments can increase in that area as well. In that way, children across the country can have access to education regardless of being chosen for a tuition waiver. Additionally, critics of providing public funding to private institutions worry

that this type of program can result in the segregation of students by income level and academic achievement, due to the influence of socioeconomic and educational characteristics on parental choice, and yield no improvements in academic achievement (Hsieh & Urquiola, 2006).

## Quality Education

### Pre-Service Teacher Training Programs and Monitoring and Evaluation

Component Two of EFA Phase II focuses on improving the overall quality of education being delivered in Haiti. In order to do this, the World Bank aims to expand the number of certified teachers by implementing and supporting pre-service teacher training programs. Historically, in-service training has received the most attention in educational development by international aid donors. Steiner-Khamsi states that “pre-service training is virtually donor free” (2007, p. 4) and according to Perraton (2000), initial training can be delivered in-service. This type of training has increasingly been provided for teachers who have been recruited to meet the expanding demand created by Education For All (Lynd, 2005). However it appears the World Bank is moving away from an in-service method of meeting training demands for Phase II. In order to create 1,200 certified teachers per year the program will provide one year of “intensive institution based training” (World Bank, 2011a, p. 7) that will be followed by two years of classroom based practical training. This will be done in partnership with teacher training agencies in Haiti and is “based on current research-based methods of instruction in reading, writing and mathematics” (World Bank, 2011a, p. 32). In addition, the program aims to improve the “pedagogic content” (World Bank, 2011a, p. 7) of the Accelerated Teacher Training Program (ATTP) that will be further improved in later years by student-teacher performance. Considering the current global educational discourse, one would think that active learning is likely to be central to teacher training and increasing quality. However, there is no explicit mention of this in the World Bank literature on EFA Phase II.

Email communication with a World Bank official confirmed that the “program is not specifically focused on introducing active learning pedagogy” (World Bank Official, personal communication, December 3, 2013). A further interview with Moise Derosier confirmed that these new pedagogies look at the foundations of how students learn and classroom management. Somewhat surprisingly, there is a focus on how to improve rote memorization methods in classrooms through the teacher training programs. Another interesting aspect that the interview uncovered is the focus on Haitian Creole as a language of instruction. Along with French it is an official language of Haiti spoken by the vast majority of citizens but according to Derosier, there is a lack of political will to make it the main language of instruction in schools.

World Bank official also gave details and insights into the progress, effectiveness, and challenges of the ATTP. When asked on what he felt are the main successes of the entire EFA program he cited teacher training as the most prominent one. The pre-service teacher-training program is churning out 1,500 new teachers a year and 3,000 trainees are expected to graduate in 2014. The accelerated teacher-training program has essentially reduced the amount of years it takes to train teachers, enabling the government to meet the countries’ desperate demand. However, according to a World Bank official 70 percent of primary teachers that are currently teaching are not properly qualified. One of the reasons for this is that the accreditation system in

Haiti does not function properly. According to Jeff, the fact that 80 percent of primary schools in Haiti are private makes it even more challenging to achieve quality targets. This is because quality varies wildly from school to school due to the difficulty of enforcing one set of standards across all schools. Jeff believes that it would be easier to do if the majority were public.

Therefore, the government has two paths before it: it can either attempt to increase the number of public schools and decrease the number of private schools or develop an enforceable set of standards. Unfortunately, Jeff did not give any opinion on which path is most likely. However, a World Bank official did state in his interview that a number of ministry officials personally own a number of private schools. This would suggest that there are personal interests at stake so any change will most likely be met with resistance. One remaining issue cited by World Bank official is that publicly everyone espouses the need to increase quality, and this includes the Haitian government. However, ministers and school administrations need to actively follow up on this 'even if it means firing teachers' (World Bank Official, personal communication, December 3, 2013). This speaks to the need to nod just to create policy but also to make sure it is implemented at every level, from the top to the very bottom.

After interviewing Axelle Latourte, an education specialist at the World Bank who worked directly on the project in Haiti, there has not been a formal impact evaluation on the project at the time of writing. However, some useful anecdotal evidence was offered that provided some valuable insights that would generally be unavailable. For example, as with the tuition waiver program there is a stipend involved with the teacher-training program. However, payments are disbursed from the central government and regularly arrive late. Not only is this discouraging for the teacher trainees, they rely on that money for transport to and from where the training occurs. Despite this Axelle said that the teacher training programs are generally well received and the teachers take pride in being a part of it. As stated by both by a World Bank official and Axelle, putting pressure on the government to deliver is not an easy task. The World Bank realizes the highly politicized climate it is working in but at the same time recognizes the need of the Haitian government to meet its commitments. The World Bank does not have a specific mechanism whereby they can exert 'hard' pressure on the government to meet its commitments. Instead, 'soft' pressure in the form of constant dialogue and reminders by the country and program directors is essential. In addition, EFA program managers need to be constantly on the ground maintaining relationships with government ministers. However, a World Bank official stated that this is sometimes a thankless task. As discussed throughout this case study, institutional weakness is a significant issue in Haiti, for example there have been three different education ministers in as many years. This means that each new minister has his own political agenda to think about that may be in conflict with the EFA goals. Therefore, every small detail needs to be negotiated. Furthermore, it can often be a struggle for World Bank officials or other program managers to even meet with the education minister face to face, instead they end up negotiating through a deputy. One extra tool that the World Bank does have at its disposal to ensure that commitments are met is the use of conditionality attached to budgetary support. The World Bank will offer funding to the Haitian government budget that is not specifically earmarked but is in a more general way, helping make sure that payments can be made on time wherever they are going.

## **Monitoring and Evaluation Component**

Monitoring and evaluation has gained more and more prominence in international development projects in recent years (Bamberger, 2012). Fitting in with this “global results based or performance based trend” (Schuh Moore et al. 2012, p. 4), the Bank has allocated US\$6 million to strengthen MENFP’s monitoring and evaluation capacity. As already mentioned, there has not yet been an impact evaluation at the time of writing. However, the World Bank continues to provide support to the Haitian government to build capacity. As noted by both Jeff and Moise, government capacity is very weak and building capacity remains one of the most significant challenges they face.

## **Institutional Strengthening and Governance**

The World Bank is allocating US\$2 million for the two goals focused around institutional strengthening and governance, through increasing the capacity of the Ministry of National Education and Professional Training (MENFP) and strengthening the partnerships between the public and private sector (World Bank, 2011a, p.8). Haiti’s 2009 Country Assistance Strategy (CAS) identified the state’s inability to implement policies and deliver public services as a function of poor governance. Since the private sector continues to fill the gaps in education and play an integral part to providing services, there needs to be increased regulation and improved coordination between the public and private sectors (World Bank, 2009, p.4). Many of the experts interviewed echoed the similar sentiment that implementation of any program could be better if there was full support from the government.

### **Increase the capacity of the Ministry of National Education and Professional Training (MENFP)**

In order to fulfill the first goal, the World Bank is teaming up with the Caribbean Development Bank and Canadian International Development Agency (CIDA) to support the Education For All Program, which allows MENFP to provide subsidies that allow for greater enrollment of poor children in private schools. These subsidies help to correct the problem of inadequate teaching staff and give the government more control over the private sector, in spite of its decentralized structure (Boak, 2009, p. 23). They also encourage private schools to become accredited, as only accredited institutions are eligible to participate in the program (Boak, 2009, p. 27). A World Bank official stated that it isn’t possible to have an improvement of quality education without improving the accreditation system and that the Bank does offer support, but only under the condition that accreditation is improved (personal interview, 2013).

### **Strengthen the Partnership between the Public and Private Sector**

The second goal is being addressed through the creation of the National Education Partnership Office (ONAPE) which is to be a decentralized administrative body run by the Minister of Education that engages MENFP and non-public partners in collaborative conversation, manages partnership between the private and public sectors in education, and encourages the participation of private stakeholders in the implementation of programs and policies regarding education (Boak, 2009, p. 19). ONAPE was created to “improve MENFP’s

capacity, mandate and legitimacy to regulate schools and enforce standards...[and] pave the way for a future compensatory role for the Ministry, as Haiti emerges from fragility, providing widespread subsidies to non-public schools and reducing the burden of direct education costs on parents” (Boak, 2009, p. 19).

The main priority at this point is to improve primary education by retaining all children in the school system and improving the quality of the education system (Wolff, 2008, p. 8). The private sector is extremely important in Haiti because it accounts for 80 percent of total student enrollment (Wolff, 2008, p. 5). This sector has grown substantially over the last several decades due to poor management of the public education system, in which “teachers are not paid on time (some have not been paid in over a year), the selection process is precarious, school directors play little or no significant role, and there are few sanctions and little oversight” (Wolff, 2008, p. 5). Due to this dynamic, it makes sense that public funds should be used to support private institutions, and that the private sector should continue to provide cost-effective education services with oversight, incentives, and accountability from the public sector (Wolff, 2008, p. 1).

### **Trends in international educational development**

As 2015 approaches, the general trends in the international education development literature are moving from solely focusing on access to also focusing on learning, yet this global paradigm shift has not taken place without some criticism. This section reviews how major multilateral donor agencies and development banks, such as UNESCO and specifically the World Bank are building consensus within the international community and leading this educational paradigm shift. The section also examines several critiques of the sustainability of this global framework for learning. The section concludes with the World Bank’s EFA Phase II Initiative within the context of the educational landscape in Haiti and assesses whether the new global framework for learning is practical and implementable.

The UNESCO Institute for Statistics and the Center for Universal Education at Brookings’ Learning Metrics Task Force (LMTF) stresses the importance of providing a high quality education that encourages life-long learning, and augmenting and standardizing the learning attainment data collection. In response, the LMTF developed a framework to promote learning called the “Global Framework of Learning Domains” (GFLD) as the building blocks for lifelong learning. The learning domains framework approach set by the LMTF expands on the traditional concept of literacy and numeracy (see Figure 1 in the Appendix) by adding a set of context-neutral competencies deemed as essential to prepare children and youth for their future lives (UNESCO, 2013). In addition, these competencies function as a foundation that is built on throughout a child’s educational career, whether in formal or non-formal education (UNESCO, 2013). The LMTF presents seven recommendations to complement the framework, which serves as a roadmap on how to systematically measure learning outcomes throughout the learning process, and to gauge how a country is meeting its attainment goals. Central to the GFLD framework is the creation of a measurement system, to contribute to greater flexibility, equity, transparency, and accountability at the local, national, and international levels (UNESCO, 2013).

In similar fashion, the World Bank’s Learning for All education strategy exemplifies the same global paradigm shift from access to learning, and focuses on measurements of attainment.

The World Bank's strategic priorities in education focus on strengthening education systems and building a high-quality knowledge base in order to promote learning and facilitate economic growth (World Bank, 2011b). Similar to the LMTF, the World Bank also redefined the concept of education and loosely defined the "education system" to include all learning opportunities within a society regardless of whether it is formal or non-formal (World Bank, 2011b). Loosening the definition of an education system expands the role of accountability within the World Bank's strategic education framework by making all agents involved partners in sharing the goal of promoting learning. In contrast, the World Bank plans to leverage its expertise and focus on the generation and exchange of knowledge, and by providing technical and financial support, they hope to establish strategic partnerships to assist education systems in cultivating a learning environment (World Bank, 2011b).

While the World Bank's Learning for All emphasize the need for quality life-long learning experiences and the need for an effective measurement system, many critics question whether the approach taken by the World Bank and other aid agencies in promoting "learning for all" is in fact global consensus and not a rebranding of old World Bank ideas under the guise of global partnership. Steiner-Khamsi (2012) reviews the Learning for All strategy formulation lifecycle into a Development, Review, Approval, and Presentation phase (see Figure 2), and questions whether the strategic plan is actually a collaborative effect, as she demonstrates that the two most important phases where decisions are actually made, Development and Approval, take place internally at the World Bank leading to what she calls "rhetorical harmonization". This lack of insight into the decision and agenda setting process is compounded by the fact the World Bank serves as the reviewer, implementer, and evaluator of their own projects and often time disseminating a solution with minor adaptations to reduce the transaction costs (Steiner-Khamsi, 2012). In addition, by viewing the World Bank as a social system with a set of clearly mandates and seeing its transformation from solely a lender to a "super think tank" that also lends knowledge and technical assistance to recipient governments, it becomes evident that the World Bank, as a generator of knowledge, has positioned itself in the center of the international educational development discourse (Steiner-Khamsi, 2012). Furthermore, some critics argue that the loosening of the "education system" definition permits multilateral aid organizations, like the World Bank, to advance its agenda and infiltrate into the local policy conversation (Steiner-Khamsi, 2012). Moreover, the trend in recent years has been for multilateral aid organizations to converge and endorse the same international agreements, such as EFA and MDG, which use to measurable student outcomes as the main gauge of effectiveness, resulting in an environment where a few dominant multilateral aid organizations set the international educational development agenda (Gita Steiner-Khamsi, 2012).

Also absent in the global framework that emphasizes learning through set of contextneutral competencies, is the acknowledgement that each country poses a unique context-specific challenge that might not fit into the new paradigm, and if overlooked may essentially hinder the development process. At times, teacher policies and agenda set forth by the World Bank in Washington, DC are in conflict with the research being done in the field, hindering their effectiveness as was evident in teacher accountability funded project in Mongolia (Steiner-Khamsi, 2012). Specific to Haiti, the World Bank's EFA Phase II Initiative has funded the Accelerated Pre-service Teacher Education Reform (Programme de Formation Initiale Accélérée, FIA) in efforts to increase the supply of teachers, build institutional capacity, and to

improve the adequacy and quality of teacher education (World Bank, 2007). The aim of the FIA program is to supply teachers and expand quality education to the most disadvantaged in the hope of making the education system more equitable. The emphasis of the FIA program on teachers as a production input is a prime example of the EFA Phase II initiative in Haiti is centered more on measurable student outcomes rather than a holistic approach to learning that fosters learning and throughout the entire school system (Ginsburg, 2012). When interviewing, Moise Derosier, voiced similar concerns with the accelerated approach, and suggested that in Haiti an intense and ongoing teacher training and professional development that focuses on the experience in the classroom to promote teachers' capacity, so as not to exacerbate the lack of quality by supplying teachers not adequately trained (M. Derosier, personal communication, December 7, 2013).

Additionally, other organizations, such as Save the Children, have focused on the contextual challenge of providing educational services to rural children in Haiti by implementing the Community School model to increase local capacity and allow communities to play a central role in providing education that meets their community needs (Center for High Impact Philanthropy, 2010). Although the post-2015 has already begun to take shape and trends seem to suggest that the focal point of the dominant discourse has shifted from access to access plus learning, yet it is also imperative to not lose sight of the unique contextual challenges each development environment faces country when implementing programs such as the World Bank's EFA Phase II initiative.

### **Conclusion**

Despite the lack of existence of an impact evaluation, it appears that EFA Phase II is making good progress in reaching its set objectives. However, the World Bank is faced with numerous challenges. Political instability significantly hinders progress due to the high turnover of government staff. In addition, personal political agendas dominate within the educational sector hindering serious progress because EFA goals are not prioritized. In addition, better coordination between NGOs and international aid organizations is necessary to minimize the duplication of tasks and make sure expertise is leveraged. As stated by a World Bank official, real political change in Haiti is desperately needed. Linked to this is the fact that institutional capacity, such as the accreditation system, is very weak in Haiti. Furthermore, significant educational sector analysis has not been carried out and this, combined with no data since 2003, makes it a very challenging environment to work in. For example, the Haitian government often wants hard data to support policy decisions yet the data is not there. There does exist a sector plan but it is not narrow enough in focus therefore the government really needs to prioritize and streamline its activities. On the positive side, perhaps unsurprisingly, all of the World Bank staff we interviewed feels that they are making an impact in Haiti. Their work is being well received on the ground and they are positive about the future.

### **Bibliography**

Derosier, M. (2013, December, 7) Personal communication.

Frisoli, P. (2013, December, 2) Personal communication.

- Hermes, R. (2013, December, 5) Personal communication.
- Latortue, A. (2013, November, 25) Personal communication.
- Ramin, J. (2013, December ,8) Personal communication.
- World Bank Official (2013, December, 3) Personal communication.
- Alexander, N. (2001). Paying For Education: How The World Bank And The International Monetary Fund Influence Education In Developing Countries. *Peabody Journal of Education*, 76(3), 285-338.
- Bamberger, M., Rugh, J., & Mabry, L. (2012). *Real World Evaluation: Working under Budget, Time, Data, and Political Constraints*. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage Publications.
- Benard, C. (2001). Learning by Radio in Afghanistan. *Distance Learning as an Option for Societies in Crisis?*. Working Paper Series: Center for Middle East Public Policy. RAND. Retrieved from <http://www.rand.org/content/dam/rand/pubs/drafts/2008/DRU2561.pdf>
- Boak, E. (2009). *Study on Governance Challenges for Education in Fragile Situations - Haiti Report*. Germany: European Commission.
- Carlson, W.L., Desir, A., Goetz, S., Hong, S., Jones, S., & White, J. (2011). *The Haitian Diaspora & Education Reforms in Haiti: Challenges & Recommendations*. New York: Columbia University. Retrieved from [http://www.sipa.columbia.edu/academics/workshops/documents/SSRC.BureauofHaiti\\_Capstone.pdf](http://www.sipa.columbia.edu/academics/workshops/documents/SSRC.BureauofHaiti_Capstone.pdf)
- Carter, L. (2009). Globalization and learner-centered pedagogies. *Journal for Activist Science & Technology Education*, 1(1), 60.
- Center for Disease Control. (CDC). (2011). *Cholera in Haiti. One Year Later*. Retrieved from [http://www.cdc.gov/haiticholera/haiti\\_cholera.htm](http://www.cdc.gov/haiticholera/haiti_cholera.htm)
- Center for Disease Control. (CDC). (2013). *Cholera in Haiti*. Retrieved from [http://www.cdc.gov/haiticholera/haiti\\_cholera.htm](http://www.cdc.gov/haiticholera/haiti_cholera.htm)
- Central Intelligence Agency (CIA). (2013). *The world factbook on Haiti*. Retrieved from <https://www.cia.gov/library/publications/the-world-factbook/geos/ha.html>
- Diaz, A., Trapp, A., & Feldman, A. (2008). *Haiti Background Report*. Retrieved from: [http://www.lehigh.edu/~bm05/courses/Haiti\\_paper5.version2.pdf](http://www.lehigh.edu/~bm05/courses/Haiti_paper5.version2.pdf)
- Ferris, E., & Winthrop, R. (2010). *Education and Displacement: Assessing Conditions for Refugees and IDPS affected by conflict*. EFA Background Paper. Paris: UNESCO GMR.

- Retrieved from [http://www.brookings.edu/~media/research/files/reports/2011/3/02%20unesco%20idp%20ferris/2011\\_02\\_idp\\_unesco\\_ferrise.pdf](http://www.brookings.edu/~media/research/files/reports/2011/3/02%20unesco%20idp%20ferris/2011_02_idp_unesco_ferrise.pdf)
- Fund for Peace. (2012). Country profile: Haiti in August 2012. Retrieved from <http://www.fundforpeace.org/global/?q=states-haiti>
- Ginsburg, M. (2012). Teachers as learners: A missing focus in “Learning for All”. In Steven J. Klees, Joel Samoff & Nelly P. Stromquist (Eds.), *The world bank and education* (pp. 83 – 93). Rotterdam: Sense Publishers.
- Hadjadj, B. (2000). Education for all in Haiti over the last 20 years: Assessment and perspectives. *Education for All in the Caribbean: Assessment 2000 monography series*. Retrieved from website: [unesdoc.unesco.org/images/0013/001363](http://unesdoc.unesco.org/images/0013/001363)
- Haiti Education Cluster (2012). Haiti’s Education Cluster Performance Satisfaction Survey Report. Retrieved from <http://haiti.humanitarianresponse.info/Default.aspx?tabid=72>
- Stephen Heyneman (2003) “The history and problems in the making of education policy at the World Bank 1960-2000.” *International Journal of Educational Development* 23 (3): 317-37.
- Jacob, S. (2008). ‘Human Capital, Culture, Markets Access and Productive Inefficiency in a Diversified Open Economy – Empirical Evidence from Rural Haiti’. [Selected paper for the Sir Arthur Lewis Memorial Conference, Trinidad, September 25-28, 2008]. Retrieved from [http://sta.uwi.edu/nlc/2008/documents/papers/SirLewisPaper\\_%20SJacob.pdf](http://sta.uwi.edu/nlc/2008/documents/papers/SirLewisPaper_%20SJacob.pdf)
- Lipman, P. (2004). *High stakes education: inequality, globalization, and urban school reform*. New York: Routledge Falmer.
- Luzincourt, K., & Gulbrandson, J. (2010). *Education and Conflict: Rebuilding the Education Sector after the 2010 Earthquake*. Retrieved from website: <http://www.usip.org/publications/education-and-conflict-in-haiti>
- Lynd, M (2005). ‘Fast Track Teacher Training: Models for Consideration for Southern Sudan’. *School-to-School International*. Retrieved from [http://people.umass.edu/educ870/teacher\\_education/Documents/Lynd%20-%20Fast-track%20Southern%20Sudan.pdf](http://people.umass.edu/educ870/teacher_education/Documents/Lynd%20-%20Fast-track%20Southern%20Sudan.pdf)
- McLaughlin, C. A., Rosqueta, K. M., Rao, K., & Summers, K. (2010). *The center for high impact philanthropy. Haiti: How Can I Help? Models for Donors Seeking Long-Term Impact*. Retrieved from [http://www.impact.upenn.edu/images/uploads/UPenn\\_CHIP\\_Haiti\\_Jun10.pdf](http://www.impact.upenn.edu/images/uploads/UPenn_CHIP_Haiti_Jun10.pdf)
- Perraton, H. (2000). *Open and distance learning in the developing world*. London: Routledge.

- Rivera, C. (2011). INEE minimum standards case study: Non-formal education in Haiti. Retrieved from [http://toolkit.ineesite.org/toolkit/INEEcms/uploads/1115/Case\\_study\\_haiti\\_PlanInt.pdf](http://toolkit.ineesite.org/toolkit/INEEcms/uploads/1115/Case_study_haiti_PlanInt.pdf)
- Schuh Moore, A., Dooley, B., Ginsburg, M. Hervey, S., Jester Quijida, J., & Smiley, A. (2012, draft). Monitoring and Evaluation Guidebook. Washington, DC: Global Education Center, FHI 360 (formerly Academy for Educational Development).
- Steiner Khamsi, G. (2007). Curriculum & Student Assessment, Pre-Service Teacher Training an Assessment in Tajikistan & Kyrgyzstan. New York: Teacher College. Retrieved from [http://www.tc.columbia.edu/faculty/steiner-khamsi/\\_projects/USAIDkyrgyzTaj.pdf](http://www.tc.columbia.edu/faculty/steiner-khamsi/_projects/USAIDkyrgyzTaj.pdf)
- Steiner-Khamsi, G. (2012). For all by all? The world bank's global framework for education. In Steven J. Klees, Joel Samoff & Nelly P. Stromquist (Eds.), *The world bank and education* (pp. 3 – 20). Rotterdam: Sense Publishers.
- UNESCO Institute for Statistics and Center for Universal Education at Brookings. (2013). *Toward Universal Learning: Recommendations from the Learning Metrics Task Force (Summary Report)*. Washington DC: UNESCO-UIS/Brookings Institution.
- UNDP, United Nations Development Programme (2012). *International Human Development Indicators*. Retrieved from <http://hdrstats.undp.org/en/countries/profiles/hti.html>
- USAID. (2009). *Integrated Education Program. The Systematic Method For Reading Success (SMRS) in South Africa: A Literacy Intervention Between EGRA Pre- and Post-Assessments*. Retrieved from <https://www.eddataglobal.org/documents/index.cfm?fuseaction=pubDetail&ID=196>
- USAID. (2012). *Haiti - All Children Reading*. Retrieved from [http://haiti.usaid.gov/work/docs/education/120816\\_total\\_fs.pdf](http://haiti.usaid.gov/work/docs/education/120816_total_fs.pdf)
- Valentine, D. (2002). *Distance Learning: Promises, Problems, and Possibilities*. *Online Journal of Distance Learning Administration* 5(3).
- Wolff, L. (2008). *Education in Haiti, The Way Forward*. Washington D.C: PREAL. Retrieved from website: <http://www.thedialogue.org/page.cfm?pageID=32&pubID=1605&s=haiti>
- World Bank. (2007). *Haiti - Meeting Teacher Needs for Education-For-All Project*. Washington, DC: World Bank. Retrieved from <http://documents.worldbank.org/curated/en/2007/10/8894049/haiti-meeting-teacher-needs-education-for-all-project>
- World Bank. (2009). *Haiti-Country Assistance Strategy for the period FY09-FY12*. Washington D.C: World Bank. Retrieved from <http://documents.worldbank.org/curated/en/2009/05/10714864/haiti-country-assistance-strategy-period-fyo9-fy12>

World Bank. (2011a). Project Appraisal Document On A Proposed Grant In The Amount Of SDR 43.5 Million To The To The Republic Of Haiti For The Education For All Project – Phase II Report# 59238. Washington D.C.: World Bank. Retrieved from <http://www.worldbank.org/projects/P124134/education-all-project-support-second-phase-education-all-program?lang=en>

World Bank. (2011b). Learning for All: Investing in People’s Knowledge and Skills to Promote Development (Education Strategy 2020). Washington DC: World Bank.

World Bank. (2012). News. Haiti Improves Access to Education with a Targeted Government Strategy. Washington D.C.: World Bank. Retrieved October 25, 2013. Retrieved from <http://www.worldbank.org/en/news/feature/2012/11/21/haiti-education-strategy>

World Bank. (2013). Our Goal: Education for All in Haiti. Latin America and Caribbean. Washington D.C.: World Bank. Retrieved from October 25, 2013. Retrieved from <http://go.worldbank.org/UTZK783TN0>